

BOOK REVIEWS

Lourdes GARCÍA UREÑA – Emanuela VALERIANI – Anna ANGELINI – Carlos SANTOS CARRETERO – Marina SALVADOR GIMENO. *The Language of Colour in the Bible: Embodied Colour Terms Related to Green*, trans. Donald MURPHY (Fontes et Subsidia ad Bibliam pertinentes, 11). Berlin – Boston, MA, De Gruyter, 2022. (17×24,5), 238 p. ISBN 978-3-11-076639-4. €114.95.

Because we intuitively know what blue or red is, we believe that these terms obviously and immediately describe a specific colour – somehow from all eternity. But this is not the case, as the book coordinated by Lourdes García Ureña shows from the outset. How can the same term used to designate the colour of grass in the Creation story (Gen 1,30), *yereq* (ירק), also be used to describe the paleness of death? As the various studies on the subject have demonstrated, colour is an eminently cultural reality, whose universality is open to debate. Moreover, as the useful introduction (3-38) reminds us, there is no generic term for colour in Hebrew, whereas in Greek, the terms *krōma* (χρῶμα) or *kroa* (χρόα) can refer both to the colouring of idols (Wis 15,4) and to the complexion of the healthy skin: indeed, when Queen Esther faints, she “loses all colour from the fainting” (μετέβαλεν τὸ χρῶμα αὐτῆς ἐν ἐκλύσει, Est 15,5).

Approaching the vocabulary of colour in the Bible therefore requires an awareness of the difficulties involved, not least the fact that since Newton colour has been defined as the sensation produced by the length of light rays on the human eye, which tends to define hue, whereas the ancients were sensitive to the luminosity and saturation of colour (p. 11). Moreover, since the Bible is a static corpus and the speakers who wrote it have long since disappeared, the only information available is discrete, often disparate, and dependent on a literary context rather than on speakers who can be systematically questioned.

The authors of this book have therefore chosen a methodology inspired by cognitive linguistics, based primarily on the usage of terms, on taking into account the context of *usage* of colour lexemes, the colour-bearing entity, and also on the use of extra-linguistic disciplines (archaeology, metallurgy, medicine, etc.).

The title of the book is a little misleading. While one might expect a general theory of colour concepts in the Bible, the book focuses on just one shade: green. But – and this is surely its greatest achievement – it looks not only at the original languages of the Bible (Greek and Hebrew for the Old Testament, Greek for the New Testament), but also at the languages of translation (Greek and Latin). Taking translation into account in this way makes for some very interesting comparisons and gives us a good idea of the differences in cultural perceptions of colour. Taking translation into account overcomes the debate that has raged for almost a century between the proponents of linguistic determinism, according to which culture shapes the speakers’ conception of the world (the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis), and the proponents of cultural invariants (Berlin and Kay, *Basic Color Terms*, 1969). Although

this book refers to the theories of Berlin and Kay, it shows that cultural differences are bridged in the process of translation. The book is therefore organised into three main sections according to corpora: Hebrew Bible, Greek Bible (LXX and NT), and Latin Bible.

Here are the main results of this research.

For the Hebrew Bible, the term *yereq* denotes the greenness of living plants and all that this greenness proclaims: God's goodness in making things grow (Gen 1,30; 9,3), the promise of food for animals and humans, and prosperity in general. But it is often through its absence that *yereq* is felt: the disappearance of the world's greenery heralds divine punishment, famine and death (Ex 10,15; Nu 22,4; Isa 15,6; 4Q14 7,13) or serves as a meditation on the transience of all things in the world (2 Kgs 7,26; Is 37,27; Ps 37,2; 1QIsa 31,6) (p. 49). *Yeraqraq* (ירקרק), on the other hand, refers to two different things. In the cognitive realm of health, it refers to the colour of mould found on walls, leather and clothing. But when it comes to metals, it is the shade of a kind of gold, made by adding copper to a gold and silver alloy (10%), highly prized in antiquity, similar to the plumage of the *Treron phoenicoptera* or the gold used to make commemorative trophies as in Ps 68,14 (65). We can see the cultural distance: no contemporary European speaker would think of associating the colour of the mould with that of the alloy. As for *yaroq* (ירוק), it occurs only twice, making it extremely difficult to analyse. Job 39,8 seems to say that these are primarily green plants, used as pasture for ruminants. The last term, *yeraqon* (ירקון) provides the ambiguity in the chromatic domain of green. In fact, the lexeme derived from *yereq* refers precisely to the process of losing this green colour and the qualities associated with it. It evokes the withering away of plants (Deut 28,22; 1 Kgs 8,37; Amos 4,9; Hag 2,17; 2 Chr 6,28). By metaphor, it can also refer to the colour of the human face when the individual is panic-stricken (Jer 30,6).

Comparison with the Greek corpus is most striking, showing a far greater chromatic sensitivity in the Greek world, whether in translation (the LXX) or in redactions. The use of the term *chlōros* (χλωρός) is particularly interesting in this respect, as it incorporates both the meanings of *yereq* and *yeraqon*: *chlōros* denotes the colour that plants acquire as they grow, which roughly corresponds to our adjective "green". But in a second sense it denotes a state rather than a colour: nearness to death. The horse that Death rides in the Apocalypse is *chlōros* (Rev 6,8), because it has the colour of the skin of a dying animal. This colour reflects the influence of the Hippocratic corpus, which uses this adjective to describe the colour of the skin of the moribund. The grammatical properties of Greek also allow us to forge another adjective, *chlōrōn* (χλωρόν), which is in fact a new concept: the green plants, the greenery. The noun *χλωρότης* is an abstract way of saying the same green colour ("green"). And the verb *χλωρίζω* denotes a particular process, one that causes the original colour to be lost and take on the greenish hue characteristic of decay. Again, this is a medical term (122). A last colour, *prasinos* (πράσινος), evokes the patina of copper, verdigris, or a green-coloured stone, and is used in Gen 2,12.

The Latin pages are certainly the most original in the book, as the subject is completely new. Moreover, the study of the Latin vocabulary shows the extent to which the vocabulary of colour is influenced by culture. The translators have multiplied the number of colour terms in an attempt to comment on and transpose two cultural universes. For example, they have chosen to reduce the meaning of the

adjective *uiridis*. *Viridis* is almost a cultural term in Latin, since it denotes everything related to the growth and strength of life: the maturity of the body, the strength of the mind, the growth of a nation's influence, and so on. In the Latin Bible, however, it is reduced to a few occurrences used to describe the colour green (149). Similarly, *uiriditas* is only used to render the term from Si 40,16, "that which is green". In fact, to describe the colour green, the Latin translators prefer to use the verbs *uireo*, "the fact of being green", the fact of showing the colour green (178), and *uiresco*, "the fact of becoming green", which introduces a new nuance into the perception of colour: its potential to vary and become the object of a process. For the other occurrences, the Latin translators try to render not only the chromatic nuance expressed by the text, but also the meaning it takes on in the context. *Viror* is thus used to express the positive quality of *yereq* and *chlôros*, and also the occurrence in Ps 67,14 to describe the alloy of gold (168-169). Finally, the translators of the Apocalypse make a remarkable innovation: they use *pallidus* (Rev 6,8) to express the colour of death. The reference is highly cultural: the translators make a direct allusion to *pallida mors*, the "pale death" of Virgil and Horace (192).

As we can see, the book coordinated by Lourdes García Ureña is not just a lexicographical study of the vocabulary of the colour green; it is a cultural reflection on vocabulary, which warns the interpreter of the danger of false vocabulary proximity. It demonstrates that the colour vocabulary in antiquity not only expresses colour, but also simultaneously the state of the coloured object (green denotes the greenness of the plant and its freshness. If the grass were yellow, we would know that it is dry). This novel aspect, seldom perceived by modern readers, is utterly clear thanks to this precise analysis of the colour terms. It opens up a field of research not only for the study of colour (we eagerly await a book on red!), but also for other concepts in which culture plays a decisive role.

R. BURNET

Hanna LISS. *Jüdische Schriftauslegung* (Jüdische Studien, 4; UTB, 5135).
Tübingen, Mohr Siebeck, 2020. (15×21,5), xxvii-538 S. ISBN 978-3-8252-5135-2. €40.00.

Hanna Liss, Professorin für Bibel und jüdische Bibelauslegung an der Hochschule für jüdische Studien Heidelberg (<https://www.hfjs.eu/>) und der Universität Heidelberg, legt in zehn Kapiteln einen Überblick über jüdische Schriftauslegung von Mittelalter bis in die Gegenwart vor.

Nach knappen einführenden Überlegungen zu der Aufgabe einer wissenschaftlichen Beschäftigung mit der jüdischen Auslegungstradition und jüdischer Bibelauslegung als Teil einer jüdischen Theologie (1-6) skizziert Liss im ersten Kapitel den Bibeltext und seine Überlieferung bis zum Hochmittelalter (7-42; die Bibel als Text und Schriftencorpus [8-18], Bibelauslegung in Qumran und im jüdischen Hellenismus [18-22, lediglich vier Seiten!], die Entwicklung von der Kompilationsliteratur zu Bibelkommentaren als Autorenliteratur sowie die zeitliche Abgrenzung [wo und wie beginnt das jüdische Mittelalter?]). Dem folgt ein Überblick über die Anfänge judäo-arabischer Grammatik und Schriftauslegung (der Beginn der philologischen und philosophischen Bibelauslegung, die Herausforderung durch die karäischen Exegeten, sowie die spanischen Hebraisten und die philologische Exegese).

Kapitel 2 behandelt die Entstehung einer europäisch-jüdischen Bibel- und Bildungskultur (43-71; Voraussetzungen und Hintergründe, prägende Persönlichkeiten und neue Zugänge wie Bibelerklärung *ad litteram*, die Bündelung von Wissen im Midrasch, erste Anfänge literarischer Narrativität, Grammatik, Lexikografie und Umgang mit der *Masora*, Anfänge der Historiografie). Anschließend geht es im dritten Kapitel um die Bibel als Literatur (73-98; Voraussetzungen und Hintergründe, prägende Ausleger und neue Zugänge, wie die Emanzipation von Raschi, Auslegung als Rekombination und die Entstehung einer biblischen Literaturtheorie).

Weitere Kapitel beleuchten Bibelauslegung und universale Gelehrsamkeit (99-134); die mystische Bibelauslegung der Chaside Aschkenaz (135-151, mit einer klaren Unterscheidung zwischen einer Bibelauslegung für die „Nicht-Chasidim“ und jener für die Eingeweihten); Bibelauslegung zwischen Exegese und Theologie (153-186); Bibelauslegung zwischen Rhetorik, Historiographie, Politik und Religionskritik (187-242), die Bibel in der jüdischen Aufklärung (Haskala) (243-283) sowie Bibelauslegung zwischen jüdischer Tradition und Wissenschaft des Judentums (285-395). In diesem Kapitel werden die Anfänge der Wissenschaft des Judentums, die Gründung der Rabbinerseminare, Bibelübersetzungen zwischen Reform und Orthodoxie, die Auseinandersetzung mit der christlichen Pentateuch-Forschung, das Ende der Wissenschaft des Judentums in Europa und der Neubeginn in Israel und in Nordamerika sowie die prägenden Persönlichkeiten dieser Epoche behandelt. Zu den Entwicklungen dieser Zeit gehören alt-neue Wege in der rabbinischen Bibelauslegung, die Auseinandersetzung mit der jüdischen Reform, das systematische Studium der *Masora*, Bibelauslegung angesichts der „höheren Kritik“, Hebräische Bibel in deutscher Diktion, Bibelauslegung als theologische Entfaltung des Prophetismus, Ansätze, mit Archäologie und Altorientalistik gegen die höhere Kritik anzugehen, die Frage nach einem deutsch-jüdischen „Sonderweg“ sowie die Erarbeitung einer biblischen Religions- und Sozialgeschichte.

Im letzten Kapitel skizziert Liss knapp den Weg der jüdischen Bibelauslegung von der Mitte des 20. Jahrhunderts bis in die Gegenwart (397-408; Überblicke über Bibel und Bibelwissenschaft in [Eretz] Israel sowie über jüdische Bibelhermeneutik in Nordamerika und in Israel heute). Nach umfangreicher, mehrfach untergliederter Bibliographie (411-500) schließt der Band mit einer Zusammenstellung der synagogalen Lesungen aus dem Tanakh (501-503), einem hilfreichen Glossar (503-512) sowie verschiedenen Indices.

Durchweg wird die Darstellung der wesentlichen Merkmale und Innovationen der jeweiligen Epoche mit repräsentativen Kommentarbeispielen unterlegt. „Dabei wurden solche Textbeispiele ausgewählt, die entweder maßgeblich auf die ihnen nachfolgende Exegese eingewirkt haben, oder gerade durch ihre quasi ‚nonkonformistische‘ Bibelauslegung von den Späteren ignoriert wurden, den Zeitgeist jedoch besonders gut einfangen“ (VIII). Schwerpunkt der Analyse liegt auf *hebräischen* Schriften und Bibelkommentaren, die judäo-arabischen Texte zur Grammatik und Schriftauslegung erscheinen nur am Rand (IX). Die einzelnen Bibelexegeten sollen dabei nicht nur als allgemein als Repräsentanten ihrer Epoche erscheinen, „sondern vor allem als Repräsentanten unterschiedlicher Zugangsweisen zur Hebräischen Bibel“ (IX; dazu wäre eine abschließende Synthese hilfreich gewesen, die die Entwicklung dieser Zugangsweisen aufzeigt und analysiert).

Der Fokus liegt bewusst auf den *Bibelauslegern*; andere Juden, die durchaus wesentlich zur jüdischen Hermeneutik und Bibelauslegung beigetragen haben, aber primär als Philosophen (wie Maimonides) oder Kabbalisten wahrgenommen

wurden, bleiben außen vor (ix). Während die Beschränkung auf die Kommentare und eher akademische Auslegung durch jüdische Exegeten nachvollziehbar ist, hat die rezeptionsgeschichtliche Wende in den Bibelwissenschaften gezeigt, dass Bibelauslegung viel breiter gefasst werden kann und muss, wenn die Wirkungsgeschichte biblischer Texte und Motive in den Blick kommen soll. Auch und gerade im Judentum wurde die Bibel viel breiter rezipiert und hat kulturstiftend und -prägend gewirkt (vgl. etwa die jeweiligen instruktiven Einträge der *Encyclopedia of the Bible and Its Reception* zur Wirkungsgeschichte der Bibel in einzelnen Epochen jüd. Geschichte bis in die Gegenwart).

Liss bietet einen Überblick über wesentliche Epochen jüdischer Bibelauslegung. Bei der Aufteilung überrascht, dass die Darstellung der Entwicklung bis zum 10./11. Jhd. sehr knapp ausfällt. Darin folgt die Gewichtung den bisherigen Forschungsschwerpunkten der Autorin. Zur Aufgabe und den Chancen einer spezifisch jüdischen Bibelwissenschaft schreibt Liss:

Gegenüber einer literaturwissenschaftlichen, literar-historischen oder archäologischen wissenschaftlichen Beschäftigung mit der Bibel, die konfessionsunabhängig ausschließlich die Erforschung einer antiken Literatur und Gesellschaft zum Ziel hat, und anders als in Israel, wo Juden und Jüdinnen die Mehrheitsgesellschaft bilden und die denominative [sic] Ausprägung zwischen (ultra)-orthodox, konservativ/liberal und säkular eine reine Binnendifferenzierung bedeutet, trägt eine jüdische Bibelwissenschaft in der Diaspora zur Schärfung der exegetisch-theologischen Binnenperspektive angesichts einer andersgläubigen oder ohnehin säkularisierten Mehrheitsgesellschaft bei. Darüber hinaus hat sie die Aufgabe, der christlichen Majoritätskultur zu vermitteln, dass es seit mindestens eintausend Jahren in Westeuropa eine alternative Bibelauslegung gegeben hat, die sich dezidiert von der christlichen unterscheidet und damit nicht einfach in einem „jüdisch-christlichen Abendland“ aufgehoben werden darf, sondern in ihrer Alterität wahrgenommen zu werden verdient (408).

C. STENSCHKE

Françoise MIES. *Job ou sortir de la cendre: étude exégétique, littéraire, anthropologique et théologique de la mort dans le livre de Job* (Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium, 324). Leuven – Paris – Bristol, CT, Peeters, 2022. (16×24), xv-791 p. ISBN 978-90-429-4623-1. €190.80.

In 2006, Mies published a study on the theme of hope in the book of Job (*L'espérance de Job*, BETL, 193). In the present study, the impetus for which was given during a lecture series at the *École biblique et archéologique française* in Jerusalem in 2013, she turns her attention to the theme of death in the same book.

In its particular focus on death in the book of Job lies the innovative feature of this monograph. After all, with the exception of the book *Death and Survival in the Book of Job: Desymbolisation and Traumatic Experience*, by D. Mathewson (2006), as well as a few studies in which death in Job is discussed rather in the margins, the present monograph is the first study to address this issue in detail.

Mies takes the Hebrew Masoretic text of Job as the starting point for her synchronic study, which she characterizes as a drama, “une œuvre littéraire qui tisse une histoire avec des personnages, les interventions narratives étant réduites” (5).

This implies that she is primarily looking for the views on death of each of the individual personages who speak in the book, as well as for the developments in their respective views. An unambiguous definition of what “death” is in the book of Job is therefore not to be expected, especially as one speaks differently about his own death, for example, than about the death of someone else. Moreover, the author of the book of Job not only uses the usual terminology such as “dying” or “killing”; much more so, one encounters numerous metaphors in Job that deal with dying. At the same time, one should note that terms that clearly refer to death are sometimes used metaphorically (e.g. Job 12,2: “Wisdom will die with you”). All these elements mean that the study of death in the book of Job has to be very nuanced, a set-up in which Mies succeeds excellently.

The monograph consists of two major parts. The first part (11-508) can be regarded as a systematic commentary on the entire book of Job, but from the specific angle of death. In doing so, Mies proceeds in two movements. In the first movement, she gives a brief general discussion of each individual literary unit. Then, all verses that are in some way related to the theme of life and death are discussed. In each case, the author makes a textual analysis and presents her own translation, followed by a commentary from a literary, anthropological and theological point of view. After this analysis, in a second movement, she searches for the meaning of the passage. Each time she collects in a table all the items of death and life. These tables help to gain insight into when a character, to speak about death, uses a terminology of life and vice versa. In doing so, she constantly links back to how the theme is raised in other literary units.

The second part (509-699) – in which there are hardly any footnotes – is a cross-sectional study of the theme of death, building on the results of the analysis from the first part. Most striking in this part is the comprehensive table in which Mies lists all the items dealing with death and life in the book of Job. This table is extremely valuable for comparison with how other books of the Bible raise the theme of life and death. The section concludes with what the author calls a “dramatic approach” of the theme, presenting the development of the theme throughout the book of Job, which she conceives as a drama, and its various characters.

In a study of death, the question of resurrection naturally belongs. Mies does not shy away from this question either. Her answer to this controversial question with regard to the study of the book of Job is plain and clear: “La résurrection comme telle est niée” (710).

It is hard to imagine that a more complete study of the theme of death (and life) in the book of Job could ever be published again. Consequently, this study is invaluable for anyone wishing to study the book of Job and its ever actual issues of suffering and death.

H. AUSLOOS

Leonardo PESSOA DA SILVA PINTO – Daniela SCIALABBA (eds.). *New Avenues in Biblical Exegesis in Light of the Septuagint* (The Septuagint in Its Ancient Context: Philological, Historical, and Theological Approaches, 1). Turnhout, Brepols, 2022. (15,6x23,4), 346 p. ISBN 978-2-503-59806-2. €70.00.

The present volume reunites papers presented at the international conference “New Avenues in Biblical Exegesis in Light of the LXX” that was held at the

Pontifical Biblical Institute in Rome (23-24 October 2019) in honour of the late Stephen Pisano, S.J. The volume is the first in the new Brepols series *The Septuagint in Its Ancient Context Philological, Historical, and Theological Approaches*, edited by Eberhard Bons in collaboration with François Vinel and Christoph Kugelmeier. The volume, with its 14 contributions, aims at offering a broader horizon of different approaches to the Septuagint to consider the Septuagint not only as a translation but rather as a collection of texts that stands on its own. The multifaceted approach to the Septuagint aims at highlighting the different exegetical, literary, historical, and theological aspects that at times are less considered.

The first three chapters, together with the last two, and the article by Martin Karrer, tackle different aspects linked to the LXX in a more general way, while the other contributions focus on a specific book of the Septuagint and/or on a precise passage, textual problem, or lexical item within a specific book.

Siegfried Kreuzer offers a historical inventory of exegetical methods and then proposes the placement of the Septuagint within the realm of both text criticism and ancient exegesis of the text. Nevertheless, the scholar laments about the marginality to which the Septuagint is confined in classical text-criticism, a tendency that only lately has been inverted. Proceeding in his analysis, Kreuzer offers an overview of the exegetical methods specifically for the Septuagint, highlighting the fact that in some text-critical deliberations in some areas of LXX research should be set free from pre-assumptions, while other related studies could help demolish those pre-assumptions. Thus, the scholar insists on the importance of giving the right attention to translation techniques and lexicography as part of tradition-criticisms and tradition-history. In the last session of the paper, Kreuzer also covers some of the pitfalls specific to Septuagint research.

Daniela Scialabba analyses the vocabulary of “conversion” in the Septuagint and in Greek-Jewish writing against the Greco-Hellenistic background. The aim of the paper is to consider the terminology in use to denote the crossing of religious borders on behalf of Gentiles that appear to have a positive relationship with the God of Israel. The key passages analysed are: Deut 23,2-9, LXX Ps 21,28; Tb 14,6-7; Isa 56; and Ru 2,12, with the addition of the Hellenistic novel *Joseph and Aseneth*. There, the verbs used to connote the action of “joining” the community of Israel are investigated, with the first result of understanding that no *terminus technicus* is present in those texts. The use and meaning of πρόσκειμαι, μετανοέω/μετάνοια, and ἐπιστρέφω/ἐπιστρέφομαι/ἐπιστροφή are then examined. Scialabba focuses on the verb ἐπιστρέφω/ἐπιστρέφομαι in different *corpora* such as Greek literature, Jewish and Christian writings, and in papyri. This process evidences the absence of the verb with the complement ἐπὶ τὸν θεόν/κύριον in Greek literature and in papyri enlightens that the verb is used in the LXX and cognate literature as a consequence of the religious and social circumstances.

Emmanuel Tov addresses the use of the LXX in commentaries. As textual sources different from the MT – one of which is the Septuagint – are partially disregarded in commentaries, the scholar offers a subjective review of a series of biblical commentaries in relationship to their engagement with the Septuagint. Then he presents a classification of commentaries based on their use of textual sources and text-criticism, there commentaries are divided according to the categories of Semi-critical, and Critical commentaries. The latter category then is divided into Critical commentaries with little, variable, and constant attention to textual criticism. A brief paragraph is dedicated to monographs whose interest is textual criticism of a book or another of the LXX.

Adrian Schenker tackles the problem related to the conclusion of the prophetic narrative of Elisha with his posthumous miracle (2 Kgs 13,20-21) as an example of how its textual history could be representative of the whole 1-2 Kings. The textual and literary differences between the three earlier textual witnesses MT, LXX, and Old Latin are substantial and numerous. After the analysis of the variants, the author concludes that the Old Latin, amongst the version of 2 Kgs 13,20-21, probably is the closest to the narrative in its original form, although not every aspect of it is to be connected with the original form.

Julio Treballe and Pablo Torrijano, editors of 3-4 Kingdoms for LXX Göttingen, and Andrés Piquer, editor of 2 Kings offer a joint contribution: *The Hebrew Bible. A Critical Edition*. As the subtitle announces, the paper deals with the challenges that preparing a critical edition – in this case, 4 Kingdoms/2 Kgs 10,30-31, and 13,14-21 – poses to the editors. This is done by tackling the problem of the different position of textual units of different lengths in Old Greek, vis-à-vis the MT and the LXX *kaige* recension. The authors do highlight the fact that this is a particular problem when trying to represent the phenomenon on the eclectic text and apparatuses of their edition.

Daniel Prokop tackles the problem linked to the description of the two columns of the First Temple of Jerusalem, Jachin and Boaz (1 Kgs 7,13-22; 41-42, and Jer 52,21-22), a problem that is rendered more complex by the diverging way in which the pillars are presented in the Hebrew and Greek text. The author deals with it from a joint perspective, considering both the importance of the Septuagint and that of archaeological evidence. The textual evidence connected to archaeological temple ruins in the Middle East (Tel Motza, 'Ain Dara, Tell Ta'yinat), seems that the pillars should not be ideologically placed outside of the temple but rather to its vestibule, to indicate the continued divine presence and to symbolize the border between the profane space and the presence of God. Great emphasis is put on the fact that the understanding of the pillars would be substantially inadequate without the Septuagint and archaeological evidence.

Cameron Boyd-Taylor examines the use of fictive epistolography in LXX Esther, analyzing the two royal letters in the Greek text – those classically named addition B and E, with great attention to addition B in connection to similar letters of Hellenistic chancelleries. The author then concludes that Haman's first letter is strongly influenced by Greek models and reflects a trend detectable also in Hellenistic literature – pagan and Jewish.

Peter Dubovký investigates how the LXX can contribute to rhetorical analysis of biblical text, by applying this analysis to the speech of Solomon in 1 Kgs 8,12-13 (MT) – 3 Kgdms 8,53a (LXX). Great attention is given to the speeches in their literary contexts, concluding that also rhetoric changes in translation. Dubovký also illustrates how small changes in the biblical text not only impact the textual reconstruction of the Old Greek but also the meaning of the text and how the message of the speeches is changed by the different content and location of Solomon's speeches in different sections of the text.

Benedetta Rossi's contribution reworks two assumptions about LXX Jeremiah; that the Greek text is faithful to its Hebrew *Vorlage* and that it has the characteristics that are typical of a translation, by focusing on the role of pragmatics. Discourse strategies in MT Jeremiah and LXX Jeremiah are presented. Then, the scholar analyses how a translator might have tried to pursue discourse strategies and by doing so he influences the translation bringing in intentional changes to

the source text. Finally, Rossi argues that the authority of a source text does not necessarily entail isomorphism and literality from the translated text. In such a way, the pragmatics of translation could play a critical role in opening new avenues in reading the LXX Jeremiah.

The contribution of Leonardo Pessoa da Silva Pinto focuses on the narratological approach to the LXX as applied to the books of Samuel. There, narrative analysis is taken as a means to better understand textual history. In fact, small-scale differences might have a bigger and more profound impact on the narrative, so that some issues classically connected to textual transmission could be linked to the literary nature of the passage or book. Nevertheless, to apply narratological approaches to the Greek versions of biblical books the researcher is required to possess an ample set of skills and much caution still needs to be used.

In the lengthiest contribution of the volume, Martin Karrer focuses on various aspects of the Septuagint and the New Testament both in papyri and later pandects. He discusses the combinations of Septuagint and New Testament texts in the papyri, and their progressive appearance, and provides evidence for it through the presentation of nine progressive theses and eight proposals. The author states that the combination of Septuagint and New Testament texts seems to constitute a next step in biblical tradition, not the starting point. Examples such as P.Oxy VIII 1075/1079, containing Exodus and Revelation, reveal Christian-Jewish contacts and offer insights into the communities and individuals associated with these manuscripts, showcasing intertextuality. Karrer also discusses P. Amherst I 3b/c, which demonstrates intertextuality between Heb 1,1 and Gen 1,1-5, albeit not consciously. These documents help demonstrate that the combination of the Septuagint material with that of the New Testament developed around the 3rd century CE. Moreover, the example of Oslo Univ. Bibl. P. Inv. 1661 containing sections from Matthew and Daniel and the study of earlier textual combinations (in Bodmer Miscellaneous Codex; Cairo Eg. Mus. P. Inv. 88747; P. Oslo Inv. 1644; P. Mich. Inv. 6427, P. Mich. Inv. 1574) appears to demonstrate that before the 4th century BCE the correlations between Septuagint and New Testament had not yet set textual harmonization. Then, proceeding with his analysis of “Full-Bibles” and pandects of the 4th and 5th centuries and their production the author affirms that whoever read those texts read them in Greek first and only in a later step they would recur to the Hebrew parallel to recognize intertextuality. Karrer delves into the presence of full Bibles and pandects, the absence of the term “Septuagint” in the “inscriptions” and following the arrangement of the books in Jewish and Christian tradition, thus, arriving at the conclusion that Jewish-Christian contact outlasted the differentiation of the canons, because of the connection of Jewish roots to the Septuagint. Moreover, regarding the placing of the New Testament in the pandects, Karrer affirms that the Septuagint always has priority in intertextuality in the bible, especially on the hermeneutical plan – with the expansion of the thesis, the Septuagint and the New Testament acquire priority over disputed books in the canon. Additionally, it has to be noticed that the manuscripts as a general trend do not divide the books into Old and New Testament.

Luciano Bossina, after an introduction about the alleged presence of the litter of Solomon in Rome during Pompey’s triumph (according to *Chronicon Paschale*), analyses the LXX of Song 3,6-11, the only other source where the lexeme “litter” occurs. Bossina presents a series of inconsistencies in the Song of Songs with respect to the figure of Solomon. He proposes that the litter should be read as the “litter of the Shulamit” and not of Solomon, the text, though was altered before the

transmission to the LXX, where the reference to Solomon instead of the Shulamit was preferred to avoid the connection of the Shulamit to the Queen of Sheba. Thus, Bossina highlights how the “never existing” litter of Solomon gained a place in history (cfr. The introduction about Pompey’s triumph).

Georg Gäbel presents the influence of the Septuagint on the Patristic Interpretation of the Bible, by presenting the problem of the “revelation shown to Moses”. As the revelation to Moses about the “plan” for Israel’s sanctuary (LXX Ex 25,9.40; 26,30) became quite early on the exegetical key according to which the entirety of the law could be understood, the paper deals with different texts from Philo of Alexandria, Ps.-Justin, Eusebius of Caesarea, Origen, and Gregory of Nyssa and their interpretation of the revelation about the sanctuary. Thanks to the analysis of these writings and the terminology in use, the scholar highlights a common tendency: the Greek terminology in use in the LXX allows the exegetes to read the Scripture in connection with Platonic and contemporary epistemology and cosmology. Additionally, Gäbel points out that a series of textual features of the Septuagint were used by the exegetes as a means to find connections and allusions between biblical texts to enlighten one biblical passage thanks to another.

In the final paper, Luca Mazzinghi offers some insights on the method used to speak about the Septuagint and its importance for Biblical theology. The paper first clarifies what is intended for “biblical theology” and the problem that is posed when one talks of a “theology of the Septuagint” by also presenting a brief history of the discipline. From the textual point of view, one cannot talk about a theology of the Septuagint, but rather of a “plural” theology, to this aspect also the differences between the translators of the books should be considered, and their different contexts.

Overall, the volume groups relevant contributions in several fields of the Septuagint that cover a wide range of topics and apply different methodologies. The amplitude of contents offered by the volume helps at introducing new points of view and perspectives not only relevant to the specific field of Septuagint studies but that could help enlighten other fields, thus, setting the ground for further research.

C. RECALCATI

C.D. ELLEDGE, *Early Jewish Writings and New Testament Interpretation* (Essentials of Biblical Studies). Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2023. (14x21), x-207 p. ISBN 978-0-19-027459-7. £17.00.

Dieses kleine Bändchen des US-amerikanischen Neutestamentlers C.D. Elledge stellt die wichtigsten frühjüdischen Schriften vor, die in der gegenwärtigen Interpretation des NT von besonderer Bedeutung sind. Nach einem knappen Überblick über Formen der Schrift im Frühjudentum (1-22; kanonische und nicht-kanonische Literatur, Apokryphen und deuterokanonische Literatur, Pseudepigraphen, die Schriften vom Toten Meer, sowie die Schriften Philons und von Josephus Flavius) geht es in fünf Kapiteln um weisheitlich geprägte Schriften („The Glory of Wisdom“, 23-53; Weisheitslehrer und Schriftgelehrte, Merkmale weisheitlicher Schriften, Sirach, die *Sapientia Salomonis*, sowie weisheitliche Elemente im NT), apokalyptische Schriften („In the Last Days“, 54-96, Wesen und Merkmale des

apokalyptischen Denkens, 1 Henoch, apokalyptische Schriften nach 70 n. Chr., 4 Esra, 2 Baruch, Apokalypse Abrahams, Apokalyptik im NT), verschiedene Formen der weiter- und umgeschriebenen Schrift („Rewriting Scripture“; 97-127, implizite und explizite Schriftauslegungen, Jubiläenbuch, *LAB* und Schriftauslegung im NT), die Schriften vom Toten Meer („In the Wilderness“, 128-156; die Gemeinschaft hinter den Schriften, biblische Handschriften und ihre Auslegung, Regeln für die Gemeinschaft, juristische Texte, Psalmen, Hymnen und Gebete, Weisheitstexte und Apokalyptik, die Schriftrollen und ihre Bedeutung für das NT) sowie abschließend unter der Überschrift „Jews, Greeks, and Romans“ (157-186) die Schriften von Philo und Josephus und ihre Bedeutung für die Interpretation des NT. Durch diese Anordnung (Qumrantexte in einem eigenen Kapitel, anstatt Behandlung bei den jeweiligen Gattungen) wird der Sonderstatus dieser Texte impliziert; ob dies dem komplexen Befund gerecht wird, ist umstritten.

Elledge bietet eine leicht verständliche und aktuelle Einführung für Studierende und andere, sie sich für das frühe Judentum an sich, aber auch für seine Bedeutung für das Verständnis des Neuen Testaments und des frühesten Christentums interessieren. Dabei wird durchweg deutlich, dass und wie die ntl. Autoren auf ein reichhaltiges und diverses frühjüdisches Erbe (das freilich keineswegs frei von hellenistischen Einflüssen war!) zurückgreifen konnten und zurückgegriffen haben, das ihnen half und ermöglichte, das Neue an Gottes Heilsoffenbarung im Messias Israels, in seiner Bedeutung zu erfassen und in vertrauten Konzepten und Begriffen auszudrücken. Ein hilfreiches Textbuch für Einführungsveranstaltungen in die Umwelt des NT und in seine historisch informierte Auslegung.

C. STENSCHKE

Henk Jan DE JONGE – Mark GRUNDEKEN – John KLOPPENBORG – Christopher TUCKETT (eds.). *The Gospels and Their Receptions: Festschrift Joseph Verheyden* (Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium, 330). Leuven – Paris – Bristol, CT, Peeters, 2022. (16×24), xcii-621 p. ISBN 978-90-429-4876-1. €145.00.

In this Festschrift, Joseph Verheyden is honored by 26 specialists. The full list of his accomplishments can be found on pp. XIX-XXIII and XXXI-XCII, an impressive display of dedication to the field and advancement thereof. The collected essays address and further develop areas to which Professor Verheyden has contributed in his research.

The volume possesses a clear and logical outline without being divided into sections. The opening essay is dedicated to the synoptic problem. Here, John S. Kloppenborg revisits the debate with one of the strongest arguments against the Farrer Hypothesis (Luke's use of Matthew; no Q) to date, highlighting the inconsistencies between Plutarch's and FH Luke's source utilization. The discussion then moves to the sayings gospel Q, where Giovanni B. Bazzana further develops his analysis of this document in the framework of the Galilean (sub-elite) village scribe hypothesis, focusing especially on the language of violence in Q. Paul Foster then nuances the study of the so-called Western non-interpolations in Matthew's gospel, examining seven variant readings: Mt 6,15; 6,25; 9,34; 13,33; 21,44; 23,26; and 27,49.

A block of essays on Mark's gospel follows. Dietrich-Alex Koch analyzes Mark as a catechetical manual, with implications for its subsequent reception. Cilliers Breytenbach urges the reader not to give up the quest for pre-Markan tradition and scrutinizes to that end Mark's deviations from our text of the LXX in Mk 1,2; 4,12; 8,18; 9,48; 13,24-25; and 15,34. Geert Van Oyen examines the role played by the five instances of the formula $\sigma\upsilon\ \epsilon\tilde{\iota}$ in Mark 1,11; 3,11; 8,29; 14,61; and 15,2. The late Henk Jan de Jonge problematizes the historical certainty of Jesus' baptism by John. He concludes that while "theoretically, the possibility cannot be ruled out ... [Mk 1,9] does not raise the possibility to the level of probability" (150). In continuity with the approach of the Leuven school (seconded by this author), de Jonge rejects the existence of a Q parallel. Adela Yarbro Collins inquires into the substitution of the label "Son of Man" in Mk 8,31 for "Messiah" in Mk 8,29. Mark Grundeken surveys the existing interpretations of Jesus' dying cry, affirming that on which it represents a suffering righteous person's cry for help (Ps 22).

Another group of essays is dedicated to Luke-Acts. Adelbert Denaux and Albert Hogeterp resume their joint study of Luke (cf. WUNT 401), focusing here on various aspects of the author's bilingualism. Uta Poplutz highlights allusions to rhetorical educational concepts and discourses, illustrating Luke's integration of "his affinity for education in his narrative" (225). Christopher Tuckett examines the possibility of a link between Luke and Ignatius of Antioch. His key texts include Ign. *Smyrn.* 3.2 // Lk 24,39 and Ign. *Pol.* 2.1 // Lk 6,32, along with Ign. *Smyrn.* 1.2 // Lk 23,6-12 and a few other possible subsidiary parallels. Tuckett's cautious conclusion has implications for the synoptic problem: "the widespread view that Luke is unknown among early Christian writers may need some qualification" (248). Andreas Lindemann surveys the various gospel images of Jesus' family along with their possible Christological implications. Finally, Daniel A. Smith analyzes the potential apologetic motivations of the empty tomb and post-resurrection appearance stories.

Essays on the Johannine corpus follow next. Peter J. Judge contributes a sequel to his earlier essay on the first disciples and Christology in the fourth gospel (cf. BETL 265). Jörg Frey surveys the reception-critical interpretations of the figure of Nathanael and offers a number of exegetical considerations. Christina M. Kreinecker examines the papyrological evidence for multilingual inscriptions in antiquity, with an eye on the combination of languages mentioned in Jn 19,20. Reimund Bieringer engages critically with Michael Peppard's article on Jn 20,16 (ETL 96), concluding that the evidence leaves one "at a complete loss as to how to establish the name of Mary Magdalene in the Gospel of John" (385 and see the tabulation of the data on pp. 386-388). Jan van der Watt shines spotlight on the Johannine community, looking into 1 John's treatment and transmission of tradition. And Thomas Witulski further illuminates the possible awareness of the gospels in the Ignatian letters (cf. Tuckett's essay above): Ign. *Phld.* 2.1aa; *Rom.* 6.2-3g (Jn 1,4-5.9a; 3,20-21; 8,12a.b.c; 12,35.36a.46), detecting a continuation of the Johannine project analogous to what occurs in the Pastoral Paulines.

The remaining group of essays turns to extra-canonical gospels and the use of gospel traditions in early Christian authors. Dan Batovici re-evaluates the reception of the *Gospel of Peter* in patristic literature and in the Greek papyri. Jens Schröter surveys the manner in which the *Apocalypse of Peter* combines old and new traditions, including the literary awareness of Matthew's gospel. Korinna Zamfir affirms the originality of the beatitude from Mt 5,8 in the Greek manuscripts of the *Acts*

of *Thecla*, leaving open a similar possibility for Mt 5,7. Tobias Nicklas analyzes Tertullian's creative reception of the Passion and Easter traditions in *Apol.* 21.18-25. Francis Watson highlights unexpected points of convergence between Athanasius's *De incarnatione* and the Nag Hammadi *Second Discourse of the Great Seth*. The volume concludes with an essay problematizing the concept of early Christian mission as it is typically used by scholars. Here, Sarah E. Rollens explores the factors complicating the normative understanding of Christianity's initial expansion.

One of the volume's editors and "the main driving force in initiating [its] production" (vii), de Jonge, passed away in the spring of 2022 as the FS was just being finalized. His, other editors', and the contributors' efforts have produced a memorable and impactful FS.

O. ANDREJEVS

Myriam KLINKER-DE KLERK – Arco DEN HEIJER – Jermo VAN NES (eds.). *Troubling Texts in the New Testament: Essays in Honour of Rob van Houwelingen* (Contributions to Biblical Exegesis and Theology, 113). Leuven – Paris – Bristol, CT, Peeters, 2022. (16x24), xvi-481 p. ISBN 978-90-429-4848-8. €110.00.

In this *Festschrift* for Dutch New Testament scholar Rob van Houwelingen, a group of 22 international authors address passages in the New Testament which are, in one way or another, problematic. In the short preface, Myriam Klinker-De Klerck, Arco den Heijer and Jermo van Nes start with an appreciation of van Houwelingen. In the following introduction (xi-xv), they distinguish between texts which are troubling because they are difficult to understand for a number of reasons, such as our incomplete knowledge of specific linguistic features of first century *Koine* Greek, our limited knowledge of the exact reference of certain imagery and of unknown aspects of the socio-cultural reality of the first century. Other texts are troubling because they are at odds with ingrained beliefs in western society or with existing traditions, sometimes theological traditions (xiii). A further group of texts are troubling because they cause problems of inconsistency. With regard to the structure of the chapters, the editors write:

Each author has selected one troubling text from a New Testament document that is close to their own area of scholarly expertise. They explain why they regard the chosen text as troubling, deal with possible textual problems, and highlight relevant historical and theological contexts. Each essay concludes with a fresh interpretation of the text and a reflection on its contemporary significance (xiv).

The volume opens with nine essays on troubling texts in the Gospels and in the Book of Acts:

Henk Bakker, "Thunderbolt from the Open Sky: Jesus' Claim on Revelation" (3-22; after a careful comparison between Matt 11,25-27 and Luke 10,21-22, Bakker concludes: "Jesus signals the beginning of the royal pilgrimage with this outburst of gratitude and joy and shows himself to be the only one who really knows the secrets of the Father, and who is able to inform his chosen ones", 3); Francois P. Viljoen, "A Troubling Instruction from Jesus in Matthew 23:3?" (23-45;

"It might be that Jesus, by this instruction, only refers positively to their precise citing of the written Torah, while criticizing their interpretation (*halakha*) of it. However, it is also possible that Jesus makes this instruction in an ironic way to sternly expose their hypocrisy, as saying the one, but paradoxically doing the other", 23); Bart J. Koet, "An Uncomfortable Story from the New Testament: About Making Friends with the Mammon (Luke 16:1-13)" (45-64; Koet suggests that Luke 16,8b-9 should be read as questions; in this way the argument of the parable of Luke 16,1-8a is more in line with the parable about poor Lazarus in Luke 16,19-31); Roelof Alkema, "Thinking Twice: Reconsidering the Johannine Presentation of the Temple Incident (John 2:13-15)" (65-82; suggesting that the author of John "deployed a literary technique (common to contemporary biographers such as Plutarch) called displacement, whereby a historical event is positioned at an alternative point in the narrative timeline, in order to give added meaning to the overall structure of the narrative", 65); Jermo van Nes, "Hapax Legomena in the *Pericope Adulterae* (John 7:53-8:11): A Linear Regression Analysis of Johannine Vocabulary" (83-100; using this type of analysis, van Nes argues that the number of *hapaxes* in this text is not different from other parts of the Gospel; therefore, one should not argue that this passage cannot have been part of the original Gospel of John because of its peculiar vocabulary, 83); Jacobus Kok, "Was John's Jesus anti-Jewish and anti-Semitic? Fresh Perspectives on John 8:44" (101-119; "John's gospel presents a Jesus who transcends the boundaries of separation between insiders and outsiders and is profoundly motivated by God's loving mission of reconciliation with the world", 101); Erik A. de Boer, "The Outpouring of the Spirit 'On All People': Acts 2:17-18 as Key to Explicating Inclusive Language" (121-140; on the generic use of masculine plural nouns in Greek; these nouns include the female and this can be explicated in translations); Arco den Heijer, "An Unbearable Yoke? The View of the Law in the Last Words of Peter in Acts (Acts 15:7-11)" (141-155; "... if read in the context of the whole speech, it is understandable as a motivation of why gentile disciples are not required to keep the law. Even the heaviness of the yoke is not necessarily negative, but reflects the high standards God expects of his people which he has set apart from other nations. Jews and gentiles are allowed to serve God each in their distinctive way. This leaves room for diversity among the disciples of Jesus, a notion that is also helpful in reflecting on the diversity of Christianity today", 141) and Stanley E. Porter, "Acts 23:27 and Acts 16:6: Two Problem Passages that Require Better Explanations" (157-178).

A further nine essays reassess troubling texts in the New Testament epistles: Myriam Klinker-De Klerck, "How to Inherit the Kingdom of God? First Corinthians 6:1-11 and Kenotic Suffering through the Lens of Honour Discourse" (181-198; Paul's stern warning has a natural function in Paul's honour discourse which seeks to maintain the Corinthians' commitment to the in-group's definition of honourable behaviour, in this case, preventing Christ-believers from engaging in civil litigation before local courts of unbelievers); Riemer Roukema, "Unavoidable *haireseis* in the Church: 1 Corinthians 11:19 in Patristic Reception between 350 and 450 AD" (199-216; a survey of various interpretations of the term during this period); Mark Grundeken, "God's Election of the ἐκκλησία in Ephesians 1:4" (217-235; an interpretation of this assertion in the sense of double predestination cannot be substantiated, rather, "the verse most likely means that God elected in eternity the church as unique place within the universe to accomplish his plan to

unite everything 'in Christ' [Eph 1:10]", 217); Peter-Ben Smit, "Gender Trouble in 1 Timothy 2:8-15" (237-256; suggesting that "the stress on female virtue may well foster greater autonomy for these women that would have been intended by the author", 237); Armin D. Baum, "Saving Wealthy Ephesian Women from a Self-Centred Way of Life (1 Tim 2:15): Salvation by Childbearing in the Context of Ancient Arguments against Sexual Intercourse, Pregnancy, and Child-rearing" (257-283; "read against its literary and historical context, 1 Tim 2:15 is not a misogynistic text but rather a statement against luxury-oriented selfishness which is in conflict with the law of love", 257; Baum translates the verse as follows: "[The luxury-minded] women [in the church of Ephesus] will be saved [from their spiritually dangerous self-centered lifestyle] by bearing children [and thereby accepting the maternal role] and by holding fast to [the basic Christian virtues of] faith, love, and holiness and [particularly] chastity", 280); Michael Mulder, "Paul's Plea to Philemon: The Societal and Rhetorical Context of an Unstated Request" (285-303; suggesting "that the apostle deliberately chose to leave his request open-ended. No clear-cut choice could keep the apostle's hands clean, yet he offers some clear guidelines for coping with the situation. Thus, this letter offers hermeneutical keys for approaching questions that trouble us today, not just on an exegetical level", 285); William den Hollander, "'About to Disappear': Hebrews 8:13 and the Destruction of the Temple" (305-322; arguing that the expression refers specifically to the destruction of the temple in AD 70; "the text makes a forceful theological point about the superior ministry of Jesus [Hebr 8:6], which had rendered the temple and its rituals redundant and, therefore, subject to destruction", 305); Albert J. Coetsee, "'Through the Eternal Spirit' (Heb 9:14): The Arguments for and Implications of Interpreting the Phrase as a Reference to the Holy Spirit" (323-343; a systematic overview of arguments in favour of this interpretation and a summary of its various theological implications, such as that "the Holy Spirit is eternal and divine, that he empowered Christ for his salvific acts, and that the Trinity is involved in salvation", 323) and Riemer A. Faber, "Imagery, Intratextuality and Sexual Impurity in Jude 22-23" (345-361; the verses promote sexual purity and warn against licentiousness; "The final injunction effects literary unity by bringing together depictions of the ungodly opponents' immoral behaviour and the diverse illustrations of it through the shared image of soiled clothing", 345).

The final four essays address troubling texts in the Book of Revelation: Jan Willem van Henten, "Coping with Revelation 2:20-23" (365-385); Pieter J. Lalleman, "Who Can This Be? Reconsidering the Rider on the White Horse (Revelation 6:2)" (387-407); Pieter G.R. de Villiers, "Death as the Ultimate Enemy of God and Creation: The Key to the Interpretation of the Four Horsemen in Revelation 6:1-8" (409-426) and Arie W. Zwiep, "Identity Matters in the Book of Revelation: The Rhetorical Device of *Sýnkrisis* as a Key to its Structure and Message" (427-448).

The inspiring volume closes with indices and a *tabula gratulatoria*. The essays offer many fresh proposals worth pondering and indicate that it is still a worthwhile (and necessary!) endeavour to examine such texts again, to leave well-trodden paths and traditions of interpretation behind and to pay new attention to the language, the cultural and historical background and the context of such *crucis interpretum*. Well done authors and all the best for Rob!

C. STENSCHKE

Harri HUOVINEN. *Images of Divine Participation: A Reappraisal of Fourth Century Views on Church Membership* (Studia Patristica Fennica, 18). Turku, Painosalama Oy, 2022. (14,5×21), 224 p. ISBN 978-952-69567-8-7. €20.00.

In the course of its development from a movement into an organized institution, the church did not spend much time on a sustained, systematic self-reflection. Its ecclesiology was an ecclesiology *in actu*, the nature of which can be deduced from how the process of initiation took place, how leadership positions were assigned, how the liturgy was shaped, how church members were expected to behave inside and outside the church building, how non-Christian religions and its adherents were considered. The early church has not produced a systematic treatise “de ecclesia”. Rather, the church was taken for granted as the universe within which the Christian could flourish. The major scaffolding of what such a treatise on the church would have looked like can be gauged from images and metaphors in use by patristic authors to refer to the church. F. Ledegang has shown this in his *Mysterium Ecclesiae: Images of the Church and its Members in Origen* (BETL, 156), Leuven, 2001. This is also the approach taken by Harri Huovinen in his doctoral dissertation on images of the church in select writings of Cyril of Jerusalem, Basil of Caesarea and John Chrysostom. Less encompassing than Ledegang’s study on Origen, Huovinen zooms in on the following: (1) images of spiritual healing; (2) light-imagery to denote church membership as participation in the Divine; (3) athletic imagery to indicate the *askêsis* towards spiritual growth that is not only an individual pursuit but also the mission of the church as a whole. The dissertation consists of a longer synthesis (11-85) followed by 4 substantial (single-authored) research articles that have been published in Finnish journals and books: “Towards Participation in the Healthy Body: Spiritual Healing and Church Membership in Cyril of Jerusalem, Basil of Caesarea and John Chrysostom”; “Participation in Divine Light and Church Membership in De Spiritu Sancto of Basil of Caesarea”; “Familial Terminology and the Progressive Nature of Church Membership in Cyril of Jerusalem”; “Marital Imagery and Church Membership in the Catechetical Rhetoric of John Chrysostom”. These four articles are interesting case-studies but the most important achievement of this dissertation is the synthesis and the approach it offers for further research on the dynamic “ecclesiology” of the Fathers. This is the first book the Societas Patristica Fennica publishes in English. One hopes it will continue to publish books in English.

J. LEEMANS

Jaroslav Z. SKIRA – Peter DE MEY – Herman G.B. TEULE (eds.). *The Catholic Church and Its Orthodox Sister Churches Twenty-Five Years after Balamand* (Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium, 326). Leuven – Paris – Bristol, CT, Peeters, 2022. (16×24), xxi-304 p. ISBN 978-90-429-4938-6. €75.00.

From the 26th to 28th of November 2018, the Louvain Centre for Eastern and Oriental Christianity (LOCEOC) organized an international conference in Leuven

dedicated to *The Reception of the Balamand Declaration (1993-2018) and Current Relations between the Orthodox and Oriental Churches and Their Catholic Sister Churches*. This academic event marked the twenty-fifth anniversary of the 1993 agreed statement of the Joint International Commission for the Theological Dialogue between the Orthodox Church and the Catholic Church, also known as the Balamand Document. The proceedings of the conference, co-edited by Jaroslav Z. Skira, Peter De Mey, and Herman G.B. Teule, were published in 2022 under the title *The Catholic Church and Its Orthodox Sister Churches Twenty-Five Years after Balamand*. The volume brings together sixteen highly qualitative academic contributions that look at the Balamand Document from a fresh ecumenical perspective. The volume is divided into three main parts.

The first part includes four contributions that set the Balamand Document in its immediate historical and theological context. The chapter by Edward G. Farrugia offers a historical survey of the acts of proselytism and uniatism by both Catholicism and Orthodoxy, with the goal of showing that they were driven by an exclusivist ecclesiology on both sides, as well as by several political and economic factors. Farrugia believes that an objective study of the history of “Balamand before Balamand” could serve to a better reception of the 1993 agreed document of the Orthodox-Catholic theological commission. Jaroslav Z. Skira’s contribution places the Balamand document in the larger context of the official Orthodox-Catholic dialogue, particular attention being given in the final section to diverse forms of uniatism existing in modern day Christianity, in addition to Eastern Catholic Churches: Anglican Ordinaries and Western Rite Orthodoxy. Barbara Hallensleben’s chapter engages with the concept of “sister churches” in the Orthodox-Catholic dialogue. In so doing, she argues that a theology of sister churches, which needs to include Eastern Catholics if one is faithful to the ecclesiology of Vatican II, naturally leads to cooperation rather than to gestures of proselytism and violence. The contribution by Amphilochios Miltos reflects on the same notion of “sister churches” that underpins the theology of the Balamand Document and its rejection of the phenomenon of uniatism. However, Miltos shows that the lack of modern clarity on the meaning of the expression of “sister churches” inevitably leads to ecclesiological anomalies in both Catholicism (the co-existence of parallel Roman and Eastern Catholic jurisdictions on the same territory) and Orthodoxy (parallel Orthodox jurisdictions in the diaspora).

The second part of the volume is devoted to the reception of the Balamand Document in Central and Eastern Europe. In his chapter, Pantelis Kalaitzidis focuses on the negative reactions to the document by the Orthodox Church in Greece, especially by the monastic communities on Mount Athos. Kalaitzidis refers to the factors that explain the rejection of the Balamand Document in Greece, emphasizing the need for an ecumenical historiography in the process of the healing of memories. The following three chapters of the second part of the volume contain reflections on the Balamand Document in the context of Ukraine. Cyril Hovorun’s reflections are devoted to the issue of *unia* in relations between the Moscow Patriarchate and the Ecumenical Patriarchate, with extensive references to the 2018 ecclesial crisis in Ukraine, generated by the negative reaction of the Russian Orthodox Church to the decision of Patriarch Bartholomew of Constantinople to grant autocephaly to the Orthodox Church of Ukraine. Andrew T. Onuferko details the positive impact of the Balamand Document on the ecumenical engagement of the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church (UGCC). Onuferko engages with a series of post-Balamand

ecumenical initiatives within the UGCC, which shows cooperation with various national and international ecclesial bodies, bilateral conversations, agreed statements, and individual involvement in ecumenical work. Ihor Rantsya explores the 2016 Havana Declaration between Pope Francis and Patriarch Kiril, claiming that it continues in a way the theological principles of the Balamand Document: it rejects unitism and acknowledges the right of Eastern Catholics to exist; yet it does not call them churches but merely ecclesial communities. The reception of the Balamand Document by the Romanian Orthodox Church is the topic of the chapter by Mihail-Simion Săsăujan. Particularly insightful is the section on the re-emergence of Eastern Catholics in Romania after the fall of the communist regime in 1989 and the discussions between the Romanian Orthodox Church and the Greek-Catholic Church on church properties and proselytism. Goran Sekulovski addresses the reception of the Balamand Document in the Balkans, identifying several positive steps in the relationships between Orthodox and Eastern Catholics in North Macedonia.

The third part is composed of six contributions that analyze the reception of the Balamand Document in the Middle East. Bogdan-Gabriel Drăghici shows the way the ecumenical work of the *Pro Oriente* Foundation paved the path towards the Balamand Document. Comparing the documents of the *Pro Oriente* Foundation and the 1993 agreed document, Drăghici proposes a way forward in Orthodox-Catholic dialogue. The chapter by Nagi Edelby describes the reception of the Balamand Document by the Orthodox and Melkite Eastern Catholic Churches in Antioch, with particular attention to both the so-called “Zoghby Initiative”, which aimed at a double communion between Rome and the Orthodox Church, and the Pastoral Agreement of Charfeh, which addressed questions related to mixed marriages, catechesis, and common prayers. Samuel Noble looks at forms of ecumenical rapprochement between the Orthodox Church and the Catholic Church in Antioch, turning in the final section of his chapter to the current state of affairs, especially to the developments that have taken place after 2012. Stephanie Hugh-Donovan engages with the theological and ecclesiological reflections of Olivier Clément on Christianity in Antioch, taking the ecclesial pluralism in the Middle East as a model to be applied in Central and Eastern Europe today. John Whooley’s chapter pays attention to the more recent relationships between the Armenian Apostolic Church and the Armenian Catholic Church. Even though Armenian Orthodoxy was absent from Balamand, the ecumenical relations in Armenia reflect the guiding principles of the 1993 agreed statement between the Orthodox Church and the Catholic Church. The final chapter of the volume, authored by Herman Teule, focuses on the Assyrian Church of the East, the Chaldean Church, and the Roman Catholic Church. A historical overview is followed by a presentation of several attempts at unification between them, especially on Christological issues.

The relevance of this volume is manifold. First, it brings together an impressive number of specialists to reflect on an important topic of Orthodox-Catholic dialogue, which deserves a maximum of attention, especially nowadays when the war in Ukraine and geopolitical developments in Russia bring again the question of the political and ecclesial relationship between Western and Eastern Europe to the fore. Although the preparation of the volume started before the beginning of the 2022 war, the articles dealing with the Orthodox, Roman Catholic, and Eastern Catholic Churches in Ukraine shed some light on the nature and complexity of factors that help to better understand the military conflict. Second, the diversity of approaches, which includes not only an assessment of the situation in Central and

Eastern Europe but includes the Middle East, too, renders the volume into an important and original contribution, which surveys the difficult reception of the Balamand Document in several geographical contexts and proposes ways to move forward in the dialogue between the Orthodox Church and the Catholic Church. What is missing though in the volume is a reflection on the reception of the Balamand Document by Eastern Catholics in Western Europe and the USA (the so-called diaspora). Third, the inclusion of articles in three major international languages (English, French, and German) makes the volume accessible to a larger audience. In addition, the sources used by the authors in a rich variety of languages speaks of the quality of their contributions and research work.

The volume is of great interest primarily to specialized readers interested in ecumenism and Orthodox-Catholic relationships. Nevertheless, it equally serves as a resource for the wider public: students, pastors, religious, and church workers seeking to understand deeper the history and the complexity of Orthodox-Catholic relationships. The editors and the contributors deserve to be praised for bringing this wide range of excellent approaches together in one volume.

V. COMAN

John MAIDEN. *Age of the Spirit: Charismatic Renewal, the Anglo-World and Global Christianity 1945-1980*. Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2023. (15×23,5), XVIII-261 S. ISBN 978-0-19-884749-6. £83.00.

Das Bändchen von John Maiden, Kirchenhistoriker an der britischen Open University, bietet einen gründlich recherchierten, instruktiven Überblick über die Entstehungsbedingungen, den Verlauf und die Folgen der charismatischen Erneuerung, die in den 1960er Jahren viele Christinnen und Christen und durch sie auch ihre Kirchen erfasst haben. Im Blick sind die Entwicklungen in Nordamerika, Großbritannien, Südafrika, Australien und Neuseeland mit Fokus auf dem Zusammenfluss von Impulsen aus den klassischen Pfingstkirchen, Ausprägungen verschiedener Heiligungsbewegungen und unbekannten charismatischen Erfahrungen quer durch alle Konfessionen. Viele der damaligen Teilnehmer wussten sich in und nach dem langen, krisenhaften Jahrzehnt der 1960er Jahre in einem bestimmten, authentisch erfahrenen eschatologischen Moment, dem Zeitalter des Geistes, das u.a. von internationaler und interkonfessioneller Vernetzung geprägt war. Behandelt werden die Vorläufer, die zusammengeführt und zu einer fest umrissenen Subkultur im anglo-amerikanischen Christentum wurden, die charismatische Erneuerung inmitten geo-politischer, kultureller und religiöser Strömungen der 1960er Jahre, die Hauptprotagonisten und die Verbreitung von deren Ideen und Erfahrungen durch Texte und audio-visuelle Medien, die zu unterschiedlichen Ausprägungen führten, charismatische Modelle von Zusammenkünften, Dienst und Gemeindeleben, die Entwicklungen in den 1970er Jahren, die Verortung der anglo-amerikanischen Entwicklungen im globalen Christentum sowie die Diversifizierung, Verbreitung und Institutionalisierung in den 1980er Jahren mit der Integration in die weitere pfingstlich-charismatische Welt. Eine kluge und inspirierende Analyse einer Erneuerungsbewegung, die auch Kirchen in Kontinental-Europa erfasst und bis heute geprägt hat.

C. STENSCHKE

Jared ORTIZ (ed.). *With All the Fullness of God: Deification in Christian Tradition*. Lanham, MD, Lexington Books/Fortress Academic, 2021. (16x23), vii-278 p. ISBN 978-1-9787-0726-9. \$116.00; £85.00.

It is news to no one that, since at least the 1930s, there has been a growing interest in deification (i.e., *theosis* or divinization) as a topic of theological investigation. Since the 1990s, the subject has become something of a hot topic amongst theologians, and in the last few decades, a stream of articles, books, and collective volumes have been offered to the scholarly community – one that shows no sign of abating. As popular as the theme has become, it is not yet so developed that large *lacunae* no longer exist. One conspicuous gap heretofore has been a complete and compact survey of various confessional perspectives on deification. Ortiz's book seems to have been conceived especially to fill this gap and in so doing provides a great service. Filling gaps in the study of deification is, of course, something that Ortiz has already shown himself fairly adept at, following as this volume does his impressive volume *Deification in the Latin Patristic Tradition* (CUA Press, 2019).

This book includes rich reflections on the doctrine from leading theologians representing Roman Catholic, Orthodox, Lutheran, Reformed, Anabaptist, Anglican, Baptist, Wesleyan, and Churches of Christ traditions. By and large, each chapter takes a rather broad view of the subject and attempts to situate it in the greater context of the entire confessional tradition that it represents. While such handbook-like entries can (and should) not be entirely original, all those contained here are valuable in that they fundamentally and succinctly crystallize each respective tradition's perspective on the doctrine, and this frequently in a way that will be accessible also to an engaged lay audience. Practically, it has resulted in a volume in which very nearly every contribution tackles questions and issues central to the teaching that are both important within the tradition itself *and* to Christians in other traditions as well. Many topics of central importance to the doctrine are visited to a lesser or greater degree in each contribution; for instance, the terminology of deification, the role of sacraments, the place of ethical development and personal spirituality, personal and ecclesial considerations, eschatology, the doctrine's considerable value for ecumenism, and many other topics as well.

Each contribution, especially in part 1, is a world unto itself, representing as each does traditions which see themselves as developing, maintaining, and even purifying the faith once for all delivered to the fathers, maintained faithfully throughout the ages, and perpetuated through the church's memory. As such, each chapter must be encountered on its own terms. Even so, it is the very juxtaposition of the contributions – arranged more or less in the order in which the various traditions they represent emerged in history – that gives the book its overall value. It is, in a sense, the very sort of book that Thomas Oden might well have had in mind when he wrote *The Rebirth of Orthodoxy* – a book in which the best elements of each tradition are brought forth much as does the rich man in Luke 1,53, bringing forth things old and new. The presentation of these discoveries often demonstrates that the faith, to many, is not merely an intellectual curiosity or a cultural manifestation, but something that reveals itself to have a beating heart, an animating vitality, that is goes deeper than the denominational fissures that so rend the post-Reformation church.

This book represents at every turn the sort of scholarship that is not content to consider itself merely an academic discipline or even subject of scientific analysis. Each author, as far as this reviewer can ascertain, steps beyond the academic

boundary and views the basic promise that God gave to creatures fashioned in his own image and according to his own likeness both as given and as being fulfilled today, in the church, and in the lives of those who are attentive to get to the heart of reality. This is true both in Part 1, which considers deification through the lens of the aforementioned traditions, and in Part 2, which contains three reflections on deification from personal and pastoral perspectives.

The first, from well-known scholar of *theosis* Stephen Finlan, a member of the United Church of Christ, is the sort of thing that one does not often read in a book of dogmatic theology or indeed doctrinal history – a personal testimonial of encounter with the teaching and reality of deification. Deeply personal, this beautiful essay gives a glimpse into things that theologians rarely write about but which nevertheless so often inspire and sustain their work. The two pastoral reflections that follow – from Wyndy Corbin Reuschling (United Methodist Church) and Bernie Owens S.J. – are likewise enlightening and salubrious not only from an academic perspective, but also from the perspective of those amongst scholars who are not content to study doctrines for their own sakes but who seek to see them enacted in the life of the flock of God, amongst which some (such as these three authors) serve as shepherds.

One aspect of the book that is of special interest is how so many of the contributors attempt to account for how the impression has arisen in (it turns out) recent history that deification was or is the unique preserve of Eastern (Orthodox) Christianity. Carl Mosser, Nikolaos Asproulis, and Myk Habets among others offer their own valuable takes on the history of what I might style “deification denialism”, and how it came to be that the literature emerging from movements so inspired by Luther, Calvin, and others have been employed to oppose a doctrine that is so unambiguously articulated by these very founders.

As commendable as this well-organized and executed volume is, it has several small shortcomings. Occasionally, the volume betrays somewhat slipshod editing (in some contributions more than others). Sometimes contributions fail to include information that even a casual reader would require, such as notice of the passages of Scripture that certain ancient authors are drawing on, such as Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen’s quotation of Luther (67). Another desideratum, perhaps one that will be fulfilled in a hoped-for second edition of the book, would be indices for ancient and historical sources), which unaccountably are not included. A considerable expansion of the very small general index would also make this volume a much more usable and reader-friendly one.

Most notably, however, the perspectives of several important strands of Christianity are missing. Acknowledged in Ortiz’s introduction is the lack of a contribution representing the Pentecostal position – a contribution which apparently was not ready in time for inclusion in the volume. Unacknowledged is the lack of non-Chalcedonian (e.g. Coptic, Church of the East) representation and the absence of the perspective of the “local churches” movement, the latter of which has placed considerable emphasis on the doctrinal and experiential retrieval of deification.

These minor criticisms aside, the appearance of this volume illuminates just how much the Reformation churches have to offer the church and the academic community on the topic, and indeed how much more work remains to be done by those who have historically embraced it. For instance, the time is ripe for a similar volume that engages the topic entirely from within the rich Protestant context. All in all, this volume recommends itself to virtually any reader who is engaged in the

spiritual and intellectual life of the church both historical and present, and can benefit them all. Whether systematic and historical theologians, ecumenists, and, perhaps more importantly, seminarians and those who are training them, all stand to learn from this exemplary volume.

N. BETZ

Lauriane SAVOY. *Pionnières: comment les femmes sont devenues pasteures*.

Préface d'Anne SOUPA et postface d'Élisabeth PARMENTIER. Genève, Labor et Fides, 2023. (22,5×14), 376 p. ISBN 978-2-8309-1806-9. €24.00; CHF 29.00.

Cet ouvrage, fruit de la recherche doctorale de l'autrice, présente l'originalité de croiser trois disciplines: histoire, théologie et études de genre. Lauriane Savoy a en effet bénéficié d'une double direction pour sa thèse: celle d'Élisabeth Parmentier, Professeure de théologie pratique à l'Université de Genève et celle de Delphine Gardey, Professeure d'histoire contemporaine et directrice de l'Institut des études genre à la Faculté des sciences de la société de cette même université. Son enquête sur les premières pasteures en Suisse romande repose sur des recherches historiques dans les archives et dans la presse, et sur des entretiens avec des femmes pasteures ou d'autres théologiennes qui ont été ou pas pasteures ou ont assumé d'autres fonctions dans l'Église, et aussi avec quelques hommes pasteurs. L'enquête est menée dans deux cantons, celui de Genève celui de Vaud, dont les évolutions ont été très différentes, puisqu'à Genève, quelques femmes accèdent au statut – restreint – de pasteure auxiliaire en 1929, alors que le canton de Vaud est le dernier s'ouvrir aux femmes en 1972. Ce choix de se limiter à deux cantons permet un examen minutieux de la situation grâce auquel l'autrice nous fait suivre à la trace le débat et ses protagonistes.

L'ouvrage est divisé en quatre chapitres. Le premier (17-84) aborde «Les prémices (1900-1960)», en s'intéressant à tout ce qui a préparé cette évolution: les femmes de pasteurs, les engagements philanthropiques et féministes des femmes protestantes, leur accès au vote comme électrices puis comme personnes éligibles pour les conseils de paroisse et ensuite le consistoire, les femmes qui étudient la théologie, les ministères féminins, les premières femmes – d'abord originaires d'ailleurs, suivies par des femmes autochtones – qui prêchent dans ces cantons.

Le deuxième chapitre (85-144) se centre sur les «Débats théologiques», en passant en revue arguments bibliques, ecclésiologiques et essentialistes contre le pastorat, et ensuite pour celui-ci. Tout en présentant les arguments, l'ouvrage situe la discussion en Suisse romande – tardive par rapport au monde anglo-saxon – et campe les protagonistes des deux camps et leurs appartenances ainsi que le débat suscité par les premières revendications féminines. Lauriane Savoy en déduit que celui-ci tourne autour de l'autorité: «autorité du Christ sur son Église, autorité sociale de l'homme sur la femme, autorité politique du chef sur le subordonné, autorité dogmatique de l'Écriture enfin» (p. 143). L'analyse de l'évolution des débats conduit l'autrice à détecter que c'est la mise en avant de ce que les femmes pourraient apporter à l'Église – approche aussi plus pragmatique de la question – qui a permis de décentrer la discussion du pôle homme-femme au profit du rapport femmes-Église et de faire peser la balance en faveur du pastorat féminin.

Le troisième chapitre (145-232) s'intéresse aux relations entre «Les pionnières et l'institution (1920 et 1971)». Il fait le portrait de quatre d'entre elles en montrant comment elles ont accepté – selon les mots de l'une d'elles – d'«être là, sans être là, tout en étant là». Sont ainsi retracés, sur fond d'une description plus vaste, les parcours de chacune, plus militant pour Marcelle Bard, qui lutte jusqu'à la fin de sa carrière pour un accès des femmes au pastorat sans restriction (1968 dans le canton de Genève), acceptant des compromis – «pas de culte principal, ni de sacrements, ni de mariage» – pour Lucie Monod et Jeanne Ertel dans l'Église du canton de Vaud, ou très lucide sur la lenteur des évolutions pour Lydia Von Auw, pasteure de l'Église évangélique du canton de Vaud. La vie de cette dernière illustre ces résistances puisqu'elle a mené une vie de chercheuse en parallèle à sa vie de pasteure sans se voir attribuer de fonction d'enseignement et n'obtient un poste de pasteure titulaire qu'en fin de carrière. Ces parcours témoignent aussi que les processus institutionnels qui ouvriront le pastorat aux femmes sont une réponse aux demandes de femmes étudiantes en théologie et qui expriment leur désir de travailler pour leur Église.

Le quatrième chapitre, le plus long (233-336), s'arrête aux «Mutations du ministère pastoral (1970-2020)». Il commence par resituer l'ouverture du pastorat aux femmes dans le contexte plus large d'une mise en cause de «la posture d'autorité pastorale», formulée à Genève en 1965 par le «Manifeste des 22» (240) qui conteste «une certaine image du 'pasteur-personnage-sacré'», son «engagement total et permanent» (p. 241), la hiérarchisation... et plaide pour une remise en avant du «sacerdoce universel cher au réformateur Martin Luther» (242). Ce questionnement est concomitant du renouveau du ministère diaconal qui offre la possibilité à des non-théologiens de travailler au service de l'Église: une autre façon de renouveler la vision des ministères... même si ce ministère n'échappera pas à une certaine forme de dévalorisation par rapport au pastorat. L'ouvrage se poursuit en présentant d'autres «parcours de femmes pasteures» pour la période concernée. L'approche n'est plus biographique, mais thématique, en dessinant ce qui ressort de ces parcours autour des grandes étapes de la vie de ces femmes: «naissance de la vocation pastorale», «attitude de l'entourage», «formation», «entrée dans le ministère», «péripiéties de la vie professionnelle», «quand l'habit fait le moine», «images de Dieu et langages liturgiques», «quitter le pastorat». Autant de portes d'entrée sur le vécu de ces pionnières. Le chapitre se termine sur l'«ouverture à la mixité» qui s'intéresse aux questionnements et aux fruits produit cette nouveauté pour l'exercice du ministère pastoral.

S'il faut encore le dire, ce livre offre à la fois toutes les garanties d'un ouvrage scientifique et se révèle en même temps passionnant, les amateurs d'histoire mais aussi un public plus large sûrement le liront comme un roman. Notons ici que le livre offre un petit glossaire (343-348) pour les non-initiés aux structures ecclésiales du protestantisme et une abondante bibliographie (349-368). Son caractère scientifique n'empêche pas un point de vue engagé puisqu'il s'agit aussi d'une étude de genre, avec une préface d'Anne Soupa et une postface d'Élisabeth Parmentier, toutes deux connues pour leur engagement dans la cause des femmes au sein des Églises. Cet engagement se traduit également dans le choix de mettre en exergue à côté de chaque sous-titre des citations des protagonistes, parfois succulentes. Dans des interviews, l'autrice précise que l'origine de sa recherche vient de son enfance: fille d'un père catholique et d'une mère réformée, elle a trouvé étrange que les femmes ne puissent devenir prêtres dans l'Église catholique. Ce questionnement

permet de comprendre l'intérêt de cette recherche pour ceux et celles qui s'intéressent à la place des femmes dans l'Église catholique: toutes les résistances mais aussi les étapes qui ont dû être franchies dans les Églises réformées les éclaireront sur le débat et les expériences en cours au sein du catholicisme romain.

C. CHEVALIER

Thomas GROSSBÖLTING. *Die schuldigen Hirten: Geschichte des sexuellen Missbrauchs in der katholischen Kirche*. Freiburg – Basel – Wien, Herder, 2022. (13,5×21), 288 S. ISBN 978-3-451-38998-6. €24.00.

Die vorliegende Studie des Zeithistorikers Thomas Großbölting schließt eine wichtige Lücke in den Publikationen zur juristischen, sozialwissenschaftlichen und pastoraltheologischen Aufarbeitung der Missbrauchskrise in der katholischen Kirche in den vergangenen Jahrzehnten. Jenseits der verbreiteten medialen, oft verkürzten und teilweise auf Effekte bedachten Berichterstattungen und den großen Gutachten aus juristischer Sicht, führt Bölting, Professor an der Universität Hamburg und selbst Mitarbeiter am Projekt *Aufarbeitung des sexuellen Missbrauchs im Bistum Münster* (vgl. <https://www.uni-muenster.de/Geschichte/histsem/NZ-G/L2/Forschen/Projekte/aufarbeitungdesmissbrauchsanminderjaehrigenimbistummunster.html>), umfassend und zugleich kompakt in die Thematik ein. Nach einer knappen Einleitung („Von guten und schuldigen Hirten – der tiefe Fall der katholischen Kirche“, 7-22), geht es zunächst um die Voraussetzungen (23-41; Diskussion der Definitionen, wie überhaupt über Missbrauch sprechen?, juristische Definitionen – sexueller Missbrauch als Verletzung des sexuellen Selbstbestimmungsrechts – sowie verschiedene historische und gegenwärtige Überlegungen und Maßnahmen zu Kindeswohl und Kinderschutz angesichts der Gefahren sexuellen Missbrauchs). Dann skizziert Großbölting das Wesen und die Chronologie des sexuellen Missbrauchs (43-77). Dazu gehört das Jahr 2010 als Wendepunkt in Deutschland, historische Dimensionen in Kinderschutz und Kindesmissbrauch, die Skandale in Irland und in den USA, 2010 als Jahr der Missbrauchsentdeckungen und -skandale in Österreich, Belgien und den Niederlanden sowie die Reaktionen Roms zwischen Widerstand, Anpassung und Veränderung.

Im folgenden Abschnitt, „Formen und Dynamiken des Missbrauchs: Betroffene und Beschuldigte, Vertuscher und Bystanders“ (79-150), zeigt Großbölting anhand eines konkreten Täters auf, wie eine repräsentative Fallgeschichte (und die Fülle anderer Fälle) unweigerlich auch zur Systemfrage führt, skizziert den tatsächlichen Umfang des Missbrauchs und diskutiert, ob die katholische Kirche als ein „hot-spot“ sexuellen Missbrauchs hervorsticht. Er beschreibt Merkmale und Schicksale Betroffener von sexueller Gewalt im kirchlichen Kontext, Täterprofile zwischen Zölibat, Homosexualität und Pädophilie, das verbreitete Verdrängen, Vertuschen und den kirchlichen Widerstand gegen die Aufarbeitung, die Schuld der deutschen Bischöfe und den Missbrauch als systemisches Geschehen durch die Mitverantwortung der Justiz und der sog. „Bystanders“ (der Mitwisser, Mithörenden und Mitsehenden, die aus verschiedenen Gründen zu oft und zu lange geschwiegen haben).

Dem folgt eine scharfsinnige Analyse der spezifisch katholischen Strukturen und Glaubenspraxis als „Ermöglichungssystem“ sexuellen Missbrauchs (151-207).

Auf Seiten der Bistumsleitungen macht Großbölting weitgehende „Täterfürsorge“ in den Personalkonferenzen aus, spricht von Bischöfen als Zentralfiguren der Bistümer und des Vertuschens und skizziert den Klerikalismus (u.a. das Gefälle zwischen Klerikern und Laien) sowie die unzureichend reflektierte Pastoralmacht als Bestandteile des Ermöglichungssystems des Missbrauchs. Dem folgt ein knapper Überblick über die katholische Bigotterie und das weitgehende Schisma in der Kirche aufgrund der mehr oder weniger laut propagierten und mehr oder weniger offen verweigerten Sexualmoral (196-207). Großbölting schließt mit Zusammenfassung und Ausblick (209-237; „Wie umgehen mit dem Missbrauch? Aufarbeitungsszenarien und Perspektiven in Gesellschaft, Politik und Kirche?“; behandelt werden die Forderung nach Aufarbeitung und die kritische Frage, wieviel davon bisher geschehen ist oder zumindest erkennbar ist, die Betonung des Primats der betroffenen Missbrauchsoffer und ihrer Interessen, die beschränkte Rolle der Wissenschaft, die Grenzen staatlichen Handelns sowie der zukünftige Weg und Auftrag der Kirche; ein „weiter so“ im klerikalen Machterhalt ist keine Option, da die Missbrauchskrise zu sehr den Kern der Lehre und der Überzeugungen der Kirche angreift). Großbölting schließt:

Dabei kann das katholische Proprium des Missbrauchs mittlerweile klar und eindeutig benannt werden: Es geht um ein sakramental begründetes Kirchenbild, welches eine besondere Pastoralmacht aus dem Status des „heiligen Mannes“, des Priesters, ableitet. Es geht um ein aus diesem Klerikalismus abgeleitetes Leitungsversagen, welches vor allem auf den Schutz der Institution zielt. Und es geht um Unwahrhaftigkeit, Bigotterie und die internen Sprachblockaden, die aufgrund einer zunehmend lebensfremden Sexualmoral im Katholischen Einzug gehalten haben und damit den Missbrauch ermöglichen wie auch Vertuschung begünstigen (226).

Zur eigenen Reaktion schreibt der Verfasser: „Umso überraschender hat meine eigene religiöse Welt auf ebenso erschreckende wie schmerzhaft Weise eine Doppelbödigkeit eingezogen bekommen, die mich zutiefst ratlos und in mancher Hinsicht religiös unbeheimatet zurücklässt“ (22).

Wenn freilich jedes der angesprochenen Themen umfassender behandelt werden kann und müsste und man sich an einigen Stellen dezidierter theologische Perspektiven wünschen würde, bietet Großbölting eine beeindruckende, scharfsinnige Analyse der gegenwärtigen Missbrauchskrise. Dies geschieht in Fairness und ohne Polemik. Großbölting unterstreicht zu Recht, dass es neben dem verheerenden Versagen der Täter und dem, in vielen Fällen hochproblematischen Umgang mit Tätern und Opfern (beide Aspekte dominieren die öffentliche Debatte) auch um Grundfragen spezifisch katholischer Strukturen als Ermöglichungsbedingungen des Missbrauchs geht. Hier muss neben der juristischen Aufarbeitung, der Ethik und Strategien der Personalführung eine theologische Aufarbeitung und weitreichende Erneuerung ansetzen, die nicht nur helfen könnten, weiteren Missbrauch zu verhindern (auch daran wird Kirche in Zukunft innerkirchlich und in der weiteren Gesellschaft gemessen werden), sondern auch der gegenwärtig engagiert geführten Debatte um die Zukunft der katholischen Kirche wichtige Impulse geben könnte.

C. STENSCHKE